
APPLICATION NO.	18/02019/LBWN
APPLICATION TYPE	LISTED BUILDING WORKS - NORTH
REGISTERED	03.08.2018
APPLICANT	Mr and Mrs Li
SITE	Farley Farm, Farley Street, Nether Wallop, SO20 8EL, NETHER WALLOP
PROPOSAL	Removal of granary
AMENDMENTS	None
CASE OFFICER	Mrs Samantha Owen

Background paper (Local Government Act 1972 Section 100D)

1.0 INTRODUCTION

- 1.1 The application is presented to Northern Area Planning Committee because it is contrary to the provisions of the approved Development Plan, adverse third party representations have been received and the recommendation is for consent.

2.0 SITE LOCATION AND DESCRIPTION

- 2.1 The 0.66 hectare site lies within the river valley and rural village of Nether Wallop. The land rises up from the river and highway towards the east, where levels rise more steeply towards the open countryside beyond. Farley Farm is an older brick and flint residential property with substantial single storey and two storey extensions to the rear. It sits in a very large plot, much of which is grassed, with substantial hedges and trees to the edges. It contains several outbuildings and structures, including the collapsed Granary which is Grade II listed. The site is located outside of the Nether Wallop Conservation Area. There is a gated vehicular access on to Farley Street towards the south west. A public footpath adjoins the site at a higher level, beyond the north east boundary.

3.0 PROPOSAL

- 3.1 The application seeks the removal of the Grade II listed granary which has collapsed in situ on the site. The granary was constructed of timber with a thatched roof with the whole building elevated upon staddle stones.

4.0 HISTORY

- 4.1 18/02005/FULLN - Erection of 2 dwellings with detached carports, alterations to the existing outbuilding and associated works. Permit: 21.09.2018.
- 4.2 TVN.LB.00737/2 – Repair/Renovation of grain store and insertion of window in gable end. Consent 29.11.2004.
Statement accompanying the application shows the Granary to be in a poor state of repair in terms of the roof which was covered by a plastic tarpaulin but concludes that the main structure is relatively sound.

5.0 **CONSULTATIONS**

5.1 **Ecology:** I have no comments to make. The building has largely collapsed and will have no reasonable likelihood of supporting protected species.

5.2 **Historic England**

The granary at Farley Farm dates from the 18th century. It is listed as a thatched roofed and timber framed structure on staddle stones. It was listed grade 2 in 1984 because of its architectural and historic interest. Over the last 15 years, or so, the building has not been maintained or repaired and this has ultimately resulted in its complete collapse. This application is for the removal of the remaining fragments of the building.

It is highly unusual to receive an application for the complete demolition of a listed building. This would normally be considered as 'substantial harm', in the terms of the NPPF and the expectation would be that substantial public benefits be delivered to outweigh the harm. Alternatively the NPPF sets out tests to be satisfied for the substantial harm to be justified (see para. 195). In this instance the conservation value of the remaining fragments and of rebuilding the granary must be considered. The heritage statement by Forum Heritage Services which accompanies the application assesses the condition of the remaining timbers. It would appear that very little remains and of that very little is serviceable and therefore if the granary was rebuilt it would essentially be a replica. We seem to be in the very sad situation where the granary is simply beyond saving. On the basis that there would be little heritage value in rebuilding the granary I do not object to the proposal to demolish it. Should consent for demolition be granted and the works are carried out it is important that the owner informs the Listing Team of Historic England so that National Heritage List for England can be updated.

Recommendation

Historic England supports the application on heritage grounds. We consider that the application meets the requirements of the NPPF, in particular paragraph numbers 190, 191, 193 and 194.

In determining this application you should bear in mind the statutory duty of section 16(2) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 to have special regard to the desirability of preserving listed buildings or their setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which they possess.

5.3 **Design and Conservation:**

The Council was aware that the granary had collapsed prior to the applications for erections of new dwellings on this site being submitted. The matter had previously been investigated, and it was concluded that the failure had taken place prior to the applicant's purchase of the site. The application for the removal of the remains of the granary is judged on its own merits, and the following conclusions do not take account of the current applications for development of the site.

The application has demonstrated that the building was in poor condition for a considerable duration, and finally collapsed due to storm damage c. 2016. Consent had been granted for a programme of repairs in 2004, but these works evidently were not carried out.

In terms of the possibility of rebuilding the granary, it was judged at the time the collapse was brought to the Council's attention that this would not be possible, and the application has illustrated the same. The extent of the collapse was such that it is unlikely any of the thatch would have been capable of salvage for use. As can be seen from the 1993 and 2004 photographs submitted with the application, and as was observed on site by Officers, a significant proportion of the cladding timbers were modern replacements. Of the historic structural timbers, very few were in a condition where they would be capable of reuse. This was observed on site, and is shown in figures 5-8 of the Heritage Statement. Thus, only a very small percentage, if any, of the significant historic fabric from the collapsed granary would be viable for use in rebuilding the structure, and what would be created, therefore, would be a modern facsimile.

There are no other listed structures on the site, and the farmhouse is not listed as it has been substantially altered and extended. No other former farm buildings remain. Therefore a replica granary would not add sufficient value to an understanding of this site to justify its creation.

There has been harm to the historic environment, and the significance of the listed granary resulting from its protracted period of decline and eventual collapse. However, it is not considered this is recoverable, and therefore the proposed removal of the remains would maintain the status quo, and thus meets the requirements of Policy E9 of the RLP.

6.0 **REPRESENTATIONS** Expired 31.08.2018

- 6.1 1 x letter from Hawthorn Cottage, Heathman Street, Nether Wallop
- Planning Application was submitted to TVBC in 2004 seeking renovations, supporting documents at the time described the condition as being "reasonably sound," disappointing therefore that a Grade II Listed Structure has been permitted to deteriorate.
 - Comments were raised to TVBC Enforcement at the most recent change in ownership in 2016 when the granary appeared to have suffered further significant damage.
 - TVBC's own RLP acknowledges that the historic sites and buildings of the borough are a finite resource and once lost cannot be replaced. It is hoped that the passive oversight shown in this instance that has allowed the granary to deteriorate will not be applied to other buildings.

7.0 **POLICY**

7.1 Government Guidance

National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF)

National Planning Practice Guidance (NPPG)

7.2 Test Valley Borough Revised Local Plan (2016)(RLP)
E5 – Biodiversity
E9 - Heritage

8.0 **PLANNING CONSIDERATIONS**

8.1 The main planning considerations are (i) Loss of the heritage asset and (ii) Ecology

8.2 **(i) Loss of the heritage asset.**

The application is unusual in that it seeks authorisation from the Council to remove a collapsed listed building from site. The building was blown over in the storms of early 2016 and since then has lain in a ruinous state on the site. The Heritage Statement accompanying the application indicates that the collapse has resulted in the loss of large amounts of the historic structure meaning that re- building of the granary is not considered appropriate as it would require large amounts of new material and would result in a replica building that would not add sufficient value to the understanding of the site to justify its rebuilding.

8.3 Both Historic England and the Conservation Officer accept its loss. It should be noted that this should not act as any sort of precedent for other listed building owners as if a listed building is intentionally damaged or demolished the Council has powers to remedy this and prosecute where necessary. Although policy E9 of the RLP and the NPPF seek to preserve listed buildings this is clearly no longer possible with the granary in its current condition. This material consideration is therefore considered decisive in respect of this issue.

8.4 **(ii) Ecology**

Policy E5 of the RLP requires development to conserve, and where possible restore and/or enhance biodiversity. The collapsed building would have no reasonable likelihood of supporting protected species and the County Ecologist has no comments to make. The application thereby complies with policy E5.

9.0 **CONCLUSION**

9.1 The preservation of the listed building is no longer achievable due to its ruinous condition and as such the Council is unable to continue to seek its preservation as a listed building. The application is therefore recommended for approval.

10.0 **RECOMMENDATION CONSENT**

Note to applicant:

1. **In reaching this decision Test Valley Borough Council (TVBC) has had regard to the National Planning Policy Framework and takes a positive and proactive approach to development proposals focused on solutions. TVBC work with applicants and their agents in a positive and proactive manner offering a pre-application advice service and updating applicants/agents of issues that may arise in dealing with the application and where possible suggesting solutions.**
-